# EXHIBIT "B"

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
-----X
PEGGY FARGANIS,

ANSWER

Plaintiff,

JUDGE BRIEANT Docket No. 06-CIV.5238

-against-

DEFENDANTS DEMAND TRIAL BY JURY

TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, KENNETH BYRNES, DANIEL THORSON, sued in their individual capacities,

Defendants.

These Answering Defendants herein, TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, DANIEL THORSON, sued in their official capacities, by their attorneys, BOEGGEMAN, GEORGE, HODGES & CORDE, P.C., as and for an Answer to plaintiff's Complaint, allege upon information and belief as follows:

### INTRODUCTION

 These answering defendants deny that there was any violation of the civil rights of the plaintiff herein by any and/or all of these answering defendants.

### <u>PARTIES</u>

- These answering defendants deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations set forth in paragraph designated "2" of plaintiff's Complaint.
- 3. These answering defendants deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations set forth in paragraph designated "3" of plaintiff's Complaint, except these answering defendants, and each of them, admit that the individuals named are police officers employed by the Town of Montgomery.

BOEGGEMAN, GEORGE, HODGES & CORDE, P.C. II MARTINE AVENUE WHITE PLAINS, N.Y. 10606

### **JURISDICTION**

- 4. These answering defendants deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations set forth in paragraph designated "6" of plaintiff's Complaint.
- These answering defendants deny each and every allegation set forth in paragraph designated "5" of plaintiff's Complaint.

### FACTUAL AVERMENTS

- 6. These answering defendants deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations set forth in paragraphs designated "7", "9", "10", "11", "12" and "13" of plaintiff's Complaint.
- 7. These answering defendants deny each and every allegation set forth in paragraphs designated "14", "15", "16", "17", "18", "19", "20" and "21" of plaintiff's Complaint.
- 8. These answering defendants deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations set forth in paragraph designated "8" of plaintiff's Complaint, and respectfully refer all questions of law to the Honorable Court.

### CAUSES OF ACTION

9. These answering defendants repeat, reiterate and reallege each and every response previously set forth above with the same force and effect as if fully set forth at length herein in responding to paragraph designated "22" of plaintiff's Complaint.

BOEGGEMAN, GEORGE. HODGES & CORDE, P.C. II MARTINE AVENUE WHITE PLAINS, N.Y. 10506 10. These answering defendants deny each and every allegation set forth in paragraph designated "23" of plaintiff's Complaint.

# AS AND FOR A FIRST, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE DEFENSE

11. That this Court lacks jurisdiction over the person of these answering defendants, and each of them.

# AS AND FOR A SECOND, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE DEFENSE

12. That whatever damages were sustained by the plaintiff herein were caused and/or occasioned by reason of the carelessness, recklessness, negligence and/or other culpable conduct on the part of the plaintiff.

# AS AND FOR A THIRD, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE DEFENSE

13. That the Complaint fails to state of a cause upon which relief might be granted as against any and/or all of these answering defendants.

# AS AND FOR A FOURTH, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE DEFENSE

14. That any and all actions and activities on the part of the defendants herein and/or each of them were performed on a good faith basis and in the best interests of the people of the Town of Montgomery.

# AS AND FOR A FIFTH, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE DEFENSE

15. That any and all claims brought herein are barred by reason of the doctrine of qualified immunity.

# AS AND FOR A FIFTH, SEPARATE AND COMPLETE DEFENSE

16. That any and all actions on the part of the defendants herein and/or each of them were performed for a non-discriminatory reason in the best interests of the people of the Town of Montgomery.

BOEGGEMAN, GEORGE, HODGES & CORDE, P.C. II MARTINE AVENUE WHITE PLAINS, N.Y. 10606

WHEREFORE, these answering defendants, TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, DANIEL THORSON, sued in their official capacities, demand judgment dismissing the Complaint of the plaintiff, together with the costs and disbursements of this action.

Dated:

White Plains, New York

August 21, 2006

JOHN J. WALSH, ESQ. (4092)

A MEMBER OF THE FIRM

Yours, etc.

BOEGGEMAN, GEORGE, HODGES

& CORDE, P.C.

Attorneys for the Defendants: TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, DANIEL THORSON, sued in their official capacities 11 Martine Avenue White Plains, NY 10606

(914) 761-2252

BERGSTEIN & ULLRICH TO: Attorneys for the Plaintiff 15 Railroad Avenue Chester, NY 10918 (845) 469-1277

IOEGGEMAN, GEORGE. ODGES & CORDE, P.C. II MARTINE AVENUE WHITE PLAINS, N.Y. 10606

STATE OF NEW YORK

SS.:

COUNTY OF WESTCHESTER )

ELISABETH M. CRUPI, being duly sworn, deposes and says:

1. I am employed by the law firm of BOEGGEMAN, GEORGE, HODGES & CORDE, P.C., counsel for the defendant, TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, KENNETH BYRNES, DANIEL THORSON, SUED IN THEIR OFFICIAL CAPACITIES, in the above-entitled action and I am over 18 years of age. I am not a party to this action.

2. On August 21, 2006, I served a true copy of the ANSWER, with postage prepaid thereon, in an official depository of the U.S. Postal Service within the State of New York addressed to the last known address of all attorneys to this action, to wit:

TO: BERGSTEIN & ULLRICH Attorneys for Plaintiff 15 Railroad Avenue Chester, NY 10918 (845) 469-1277

ELISABETH M. CRUPI

Sworn to before me this 21ST day of AUGUST, 2006

**NOTARY PUBLIC** 

MARIAN RENNA
Notary Public, State of New York
No. 4997090
Qualitied in Westchester County
Commission Expires June 1220

UNITED STATES DISTRI SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF	5)  K  		 er .
PEGGY FARGANIS,	 	======	 :======X

Plaintiff,

### - against -

TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, KENNETH BRYNES, DANIEL THORSON, Sued in their individual capacities,

#### ANSWER

BOEGGEMAN, GEORGE, HODGES & CORDE, P.C. Attorneys for Defendants:

TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, KENNETH BRYNES, DANIEL THORSON, Sued in their individual capacities 11 Martine Avenue

White Plains, New York 10606 (914) 761-2252 FAX NO.: (914) 761-5211

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

PEGGY FARGANIS,

Plaintiff,

ANSWER

06-CV-5238

TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, KENNETH BYRNES, DANIEL THORSON, sued in their individual capacities,

Defendants.

complaint in the above-captioned action:

Defendants Dennis Barnettt, Michael Taback, Kenneth Byrnes and Daniel Thorson, by and through their attorney James B. Tuttle, Esq., hereby provide the following in answer to the

1. DENY knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the allegations set forth in paragraphs "1", "2", "5", "7", "8", "9", "10", "11", "12", "13" and "18".

DENY each and every allegation set forth in paragraphs "14", "15", "16", "17"
 and "23".

3. With respect to the allegations set forth in paragraph "19", DENY that defendant Barnett took actions towards the palintiff that were cruel, malicious or discriminatory and DENY knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations.

- 4. With respect to the allegations set forth in paragraph "20", DENY that any of the answering defendants engaged in discriminatory actions towards the plaintiff and DENY knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations.
- 5. With respect to the allegations set forth in paragraph "21", DENY that any of the answering defendants engaged in discriminatory treatment towards the plaintiff and DENY knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth or falsity of the remaining allegations.

### AS AND FOR A FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, THE ANSWERING DEFENDANTS ASSERT AS FOLLOWS:

 All answering defendants are entitled to qualified immunity and demand a hearing on said defense at the earliest opportunity.

# AS AND FOR A SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, THE ANSWERING DEFENDANTS ASSERT AS FOLLOWS:

 The complaint fails to state a cause of action against any of the defendants in their individual capacity.

### AS AND FOR A THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, THE ANSWERING DEFENDANTS ASSERT AS FOLLOWS:

8. All acts of omission or commission taken by the answering defendants in connection with this matter were taken in the course and scope of their employment as Town of Montgomery Police Officers and not in their individual capacity.

# AS AND FOR A FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, THE ANSWERING DEFENDANTS ASSERT AS FOLLOWS:

 All actions taken by all of the answering defendants at the times and places alleged in the complaint were reasonable.

# AS AND FOR A FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, THE ANSWERING DEFENDANTS ASSERT AS FOLLOWS:

10. All actions taken by the answering defendants at the times and places alleged in the complaint were justified.

### AS AND FOR A SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE, THE ANSWERING DEFENDANTS ASSERT AS FOLLOWS:

11. The injuries and damages, if any, sustained by the plaintiff were caused and/or contributed to by the negligence and/or culpable conduct of third-parties over whom the answering defendants had no control.

WHEREFORE, the answering defendants demand judgment dismissing the plaintiff's complaint as against them, together with such other and further relief as to the Court may seem just and proper.

Dated:

August 18, 2006

At:

Latham, NY

Yours,

THE TUTTLE LAW FIRM

James B. Tuttle, Esq.

Attorneys for Barnett, Taback, Byrnes

and Thorson

10 Century Hill Drive, Suite 4

Latham, NY 12110

Office: (518) 783-1001

### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

PEGGY FARGANIS,

Plaintiff,

TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, KENNETH BYRNES, DANIEL THORSON, sued in their individual capacities,

06-CV-5238

Defendants.

# AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE BY MAIL

STATE OF NEW YORK

: SS.

COUNTY OF ALBANY

CHRISTINA L. WAGAR, being duly sworn, deposes and says:

That deponent is not a party to the action, is over the age of 18 years and resides at Clifton Park, New York. That on the 18th day of August 2006, deponent served Answer of the individual defendants by regular mail in a postage-paid, properly addressed wrapper, in an official depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States postal service in Latham, New York to the following:

Helen G. Ullrich, Esq. Bergstein & Ullrich Attorneys for the plaintiff 15 Railroad Avenue Chester, NY 10918

John Walsh, Esq.

Boeggeman, George, Hodges & Corde, P.C.

Attorneys for the Town of Montgomery

11 Martine Avenue

White Plains, NY 10606

CHRISTINA L. WAGAR

Sworn to before me this 18th day of August 2006.

JAMES B. TUTTLE Notary Public, State of New York No. 02TU5011266 Qualified in Saratoga County Commission Expires April 19, \_\_\_

### U.S. DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

PEGGY FARGANIS,

Plaintiff,

TOWN OF MONTGOMERY, DENNIS BARNETT, MICHAEL TABACK, KENNETH BYRNES, DANIEL THORSON, sued in their individual capacities,

Defendants.

### ANSWER 06-CV-5238

### THE TUTTLE LAW FIRM JAMES B. TUTTLE, ESQ.

Attorney for defendants Barnett, Taback, Byrnes & Thorson 10 Century Hill Drive, Suite 4 Latham, NY 12110 (518) 783-1001

Due and timely service of a copy of the within

is hereby admitted,

Dated,

Attorney(s) for

(NOTICE OF ENTRY)

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that the within is a true copy of a duly entered in the office of the clerk of the within named court on

, 2001.

(NOTICE OF SETTLEMENT)

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that an order of which the within is a true copy will be presented for settlement to One of the judges of the withing named Court, at

the Hon.

day of

, 2001 at

Dated,

Yours, etc.

### THE TUTTLE LAW FIRM JAMES B. TUTTLE, ESQ.

Attorney for defendants Barnett, Taback, Byrnes & Thorson 10 Century Hill Drive, Suite 4 Latham, NY 12110 (518) 783-1001